Meta-analysis of the effects of spirituality in the organization and comprehensive model

Jafae Ahangaran, Farzaneh Khooshebast *, Elham Vahedi

Department Of Tourism, University of Science and Culture, Tehran, Iran

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Received 10 December 2015
Received in revised form
25 February 2016
Accepted 25 February 2016

Keywords:
Spirituality
Organization
Effects
Meta-analysis

ABSTRACT

Recently the subject of spirituality in the organization is an important subject in management and organizational behavior literature and many researchers have studied different aspects of the influence of spirituality on productivity. The spirituality is an attempt to foster sensitivity towards the relationship with oneself, with other people, the relationship with non-humans and relationship with God, or explore to what is needed for humanity, and seeking to achieve full humanity. Low level of productivity is one of the most organizations problems and organizational spirituality is a good way to treatment of organizational problems. According to the position of spirituality in organizations, in this study used the method of meta-analysis to examine the variables influenced of spirituality in the organization from the perspective of active researchers in this field, And the number seven article was examined. The results of the meta-analysis showed that spirituality promote organizational citizenship behavior and affected on the creativity and innovation. The increase of the commitment and entrepreneurial behavior and leadership success also depends on the spirituality in organizations. At the end of this study is a comprehensive model that was presented from all perspectives.

1. Introduction

Humans have entered in a new and unprecedented era in their life, a period in which in that, the world is dramatically changing and evolving. In the modern and rational paradigm, spirit and inner needs share have been neglected (Fargangi et al., 2005). The "spirituality" term, derived from the root "spirituous" means "heart and soul" (Moghimi et al., 2010). Life is meaningless without a work, and work without the spirit has destroyed the life. So many people interest in spirituality experience not only in personal works but also in other levels of work and life (Moghimi et al., 2010). Working spirituality can be viewed as an attempt to explore the ultimate goal in a person's working life, in order to establish a strong relationship between the individual and the colleagues and others who are somehow involved in his work, as well as consistency or unity between the beliefs of a person with the values of the organization. Various studies have addressed the spirituality of the organization and its relationship with different variables has considered. But due to addressing the spirituality as discrete and disparate subjects, needs to be considered in this study using meta-analysis to examine these discrete studies and finally the effects of spirituality in the organization as the form of a comprehensive model is introduced. The main objective of this study was to investigate the effects of spirituality in the workplace organization or meta-analysis, and the main question in this research is to follow:
1. What are the effects of spirituality on the organization from different perspectives?
2. How is comprehensive model of spirituality?

2. Theoretical principles and literature of research

2.1. Spirituality

Spirituality term is used in various fields, thus providing a comprehensive definition that is acceptable to all is impossible.

The concept of spirituality interferes with other Concepts and applying it is difficult. Nevertheless, various authors have referred to the definitions of spirituality in their articles:

Spirituality, as an inspirational and refreshing force that gives life meaning and direction and lead us towards goals gives (McKnight, 1984; Cavanagh, 1999). Spirituality is the desire to find the life
ultimate goals as with terms such as energy, meaning and also knowing is mentioned (Cavanagh, 1999).

Spirituality is as driving force towards the superior objectives, beyond the individual person and his religion (McKnight, 1984).

Definitions of spirituality by others also have been mentioned as a mean and awareness in life.

2.2. The difference between spirituality and religion

Historically spirituality is rooted in religion. In the recent period due to the introduction of spirituality in various spheres seem spirituality is not associated with any particular religion. There are various reasons for this claim; spirituality is beyond the religions different category (Cavanagh, 1999):

Most Western societies are pluralistic, so no prominent religious serve as the spirituality foundation there.

Using of particular religious in public can increase mistrust, hatred of foreigners, suspicion and will continue could lead to the decline of democracy and even revolution and war to be followed (Cavanagh, 1999).

2.3. Spirituality within the organization

Work environment has capability translation into a spiritual and friendly environment. Work can be inner spiritual life and promote employees. So we can say that the inner life of employees with meaningful work content located will foster community (Farokhi, 2010).

2.3.1. Approach of spirituality in the workplace

A common classification of different approaches to spirituality in the workplace that have been presented by several groups of researchers, include:

- Religious approach
- Introspective / metaphysical approach
- Existentialist/ secular approach (Krishnakumar and Neck, 2002).

If we will also consider the views of people opposed to religion and spirituality, must be add the following approach:

- Opponents of spirituality (Boje, 2000).

2.3.1.1. Religious approach

Fans of religious approach to spirituality, know the spirituality as a part of religion (Krishnakumar and Neck, 2002).

For example, Christians, especially Protestants are following the ideas of Martin Luther, Spirituality and an invitation to participate in the creative work of God and God know the tasks and believe that working in partnership with God (Naylor et al., 1996).

Hindus believe their efforts and leave the result to God (Menton, 1997), Buddhists hard work conduit for improving the life of a person they know and believe that the work leads to perfection. The followers of Taoism and Confucianism believe cooperation and teamwork is valuable (Krishnakumar and Neak, 2002).

2.3.1.2. Introspective / metaphysical approach

Metaphysical perspective on spirituality sees spirituality as arises from awareness within each person that it is beyond the values and beliefs planned. In fact, in this approach, spirituality is concept beyond the rules in different religions, non-professional, non-hierarchical and separate from the religious (Krishnakumar and Neck, 2002).

In this approach, it is believed that all living and non-living existents within itself was a sacred and originator force that must be understood. In fact, people should be able to without hurting the others embrace their spiritual affairs (Marques, 2005).

2.3.1.3. Existentialist/ secular approach

In this approach the main goal is to find meaning in work environment (Krishnakumar and Neak, 2002). This view sees spirituality as a search for meaning, in this view; some of those questions are raised:

- Why do I do?
- What is the sense of the work I do?
- What things this work brings to me?
- What's reason of my existence in organization?

The answer to these questions gives a sense of meaning and satisfaction and resulting efficiency in increased. Conversely, people who do not feel a sense of alienation, will be disappointed and this reduces their productivity and is made failure.

2.3.1.4. Opposite spirituality approach

In this approach than spirituality and particularly religion, there is a negative outlook and is said that spirituality and religion are both tools for the exploitation of followers and subordinates are in the hands of managers and leaders (Boje, 2000).

3. The effects of spirituality in organization

Various studies conducted in various dimensions examined in relation to spirituality that in continue it is presented.

1. Improvement of organizational citizenship behavior
2. Creativity
3. Commitment creation
4. Success in leadership
5. Entrepreneurship
6. Customer Satisfaction

3.1. Spirituality and improvement organizational citizenship
Farhangi et al. (2006) found a meaningful relationship between behavior of organizational citizenship and spirituality in workplace. In this research, the behaviors are not considered as optional task and it is not intended to directly reward but for improving the effectiveness of this type of behavior increases. Organizational citizenship behaviors or the behaviors beyond the duty of employees despite the obvious effect on organizational performance were largely ignored in the past. In fact, in raw terms, these behaviors were considered outside the scope of employment. In recent years, especially with the beginning of the twenty-first century, number of researches in this field has grown and this trend continues because many researchers a positive impact on organizational effectiveness and organizational citizenship behaviors have confirmed. For this purpose, variables such as job satisfaction, organizational commitment, corporate identity, organizational justice, trust, types of leadership, relations between leader and followers, organizational citizenship behavior have been proposed as risk factors, but one of the variables in previous research in this area is neglected, is spirituality in the workplace that has the potential to impact on organizational variables and organizational citizenship behavior is likely. In recent research, organizational citizenship behavior consists of four dimensions altruism, conscientiousness, magnanimity and passed civil behavior is considered. Altruism means helping other members of the organization to solve their problems. Conscientiousness, said to be optional behavior that goes beyond the minimum requirements, such as a person more than typical scenarios remain at work or an employee who does not spend a lot of time to relax. The purpose of magnanimity and forgiveness is showing tolerance and forgiveness in non-ideal conditions of organization without complaint and ultimately purpose of civil behavior, participation and accountability in corporate life and also offer good image of the organization. However, based on various studies, organizational citizenship behavior and organizational performance and effectiveness have a direct relationship and this has led many organizations to create this behavior in their employees (Farhangi et al., 2006). Therefore, as shown in the following model (Fig. 1), spirituality in the workplace leads to improved organizational citizenship behavior and consequently the behavior of citizens are strengthened.

3.2. Spirituality and creativity

The inspirational decision (intuition) is an unconscious process that obtained out of the experience and creativity as the use of mental abilities to create a new idea or concept. Novelty and usefulness are two necessary conditions to be considered a creative idea. By definition, individual creativity is different with organizational innovation. Creativity is generation and production of new thoughts, while innovation is the implementation of those thoughts (Zhou, 2006). In fact, inspiration is providing a path and innovation is connectivity to optimal and creativity is link between them. Creativity is not created in a vacuum, but is in need of incentives (Neck and Milliman, 1994). Spirituality can help people to expand their realm of consciousness and know normal boundaries of human knowledge beyond their knowledge and increase their insight and creativity (cash and Gray, 2000).

**Fig. 1:** The relationship between spirituality in the workplace and improvement of the citizenship behaviors (Farhangi et al., 2006)

Spirituality can be associated with God's creative powers of the human mind (Moghimi et al., 2010). As reflected in the upper Fig., spirituality, religion and morality are not shared with other areas of complete and not complete contrast, but continually they are associated with multilateral engagement. In the lower part of the model be seen the spirituality on all the components of the innovation process, from inspiration, creativity and innovation is effective. Of course, numerous other factors such as knowledge, experience, abilities and personality inherent employee, his familiarity with the methods and algorithms for problem solving and even organizational climate is effective in promoting creativity and the role of the supernatural world such as unlimited consciousness, unconscious and also in strengthening or weakening of creativity is undeniable, since the monotheistic religions such as Islam have supernatural origin, look at this aspect of creativity and intuition seems useful from the perspective of religion (Fig. 2).

3.3. Spirituality and commitment

Kordtamini and Kuhi (2011) in their research using spirituality have predicted dimensions of
organizational commitment. Human resources committed to organization reduce delays and displacements, caused a significant increase in organizational performance, mental freshness of employees and achieve organizational and individual goals.

![Diagram: Spirituality in organization](image)

Fig. 2: The relationship between spirituality at work and creativity of employees (Moghimi et al., 2010)

Organizational commitment, like other organizational behavior concepts introduced in different ways and multiple views have been considered. Organizational commitment can be a simple belief in the values and goals of the organization, sense of loyalty to the organization, moral obligation, the heart's desire and need to stay in the organization that based on Meyer and Allen's view, three components is intended (Meyer and Allen, 1991):

1- Emotional commitment (willingness to share power and allegiance to continue their work in the organization)
2- Continued commitment (willingness to undertake continuous activities based on individual diagnosis of the costs associated with leaving the Organization)
3- Normative commitment (is feeling of responsibility to remain as a member of the organization).

Organization to achieve its objectives requires efficient manpower and committed human resources.

Regardless of the financing, work may be some of the basic human needs such as mental and physical activity, social relationships, a sense of worth, confidence and ability to satisfy. On the other hand, may be a major source of mental stress. May be a satisfactory job over time to become a source of dissatisfaction is leading to burnout. Given the widespread presence of organizations in societies and wanted and unwanted consequences that organizations are the source of their, the presence of spirituality in organizations seems inevitable. According to the rule of mechanic and intellectual, workplaces are highly needed to efflorescence of spirituality. According to various studies indicated that all of these models and try to develop it in a work environment scholars showed that people who have more spirituality, more a sense of commitment, independence and loyalty to the organization and addressing less feel they are being unhelpful. Moore and Casper (2006) believed that people who have higher organizational spirituality has a greater organizational commitment and less job burnout. Generally there is an inevitable necessity for spirituality in organizations due to that employ organizational spirituality increase loyalty and commitment to the organization (Kordtamini and Kuhi, 2011). The results of this section coms to Fig. 3.

3.4. Spirituality and success in leadership

Khaef Elahi et al. (2010) also pointed out the effect of spirituality on leadership success. One of the main components of spiritual work environments are spiritual leaders. Organizations on its way to becoming learning organizations, the need to promote spirituality and spiritual leaders have so requires (Khaef Elahi et al., 2010). Leaders, who in different situations, giving insight on things instead of intervene in jobs, emphasize on trust instead of controlling, emphasize on independence rather than restricting, and instead of attempting to explain his image emphasize on humility. In fact, the spiritual leader of the values, beliefs and behaviors that requires intrinsic motivation Hood and others, members of the organization provides spiritual survival. Spiritual leadership principles and practices breathe control techniques that makes. Tasks and activities of members of the organization by linking them to the deep inner meaning of the day and increase commitment, motivation, and energy efficiency of their organization or group are (Khaef Elahi et al., 2010).

The effect of spirituality in leadership success is because spiritual leaders, traditional leaders towards a higher rating receive from their followers. The relationship between the leader and spirituality, entering and inspire spiritual values such as honesty and integrity and moral behavior in organizations such as the type of friendly and over.
As a result of joint research that has been done in this area, the impact of these values and behaviors that lead to success is spiritual. Leadership success can be of three visions: 1. Pyrvan 2- Group (organization) 3-personal aspects examined.

Fig. 3: The relationship between spirituality at work and commitment of staff (Kordtamini and Kuhi, 2011)

When a leader is successful in leading their followers to achieve high satisfaction levels and remain loyal to the organization and to be committed morally and improve the level of organizational behavior followers. Others praise of the most important reasons for loyalty to their leader and the followers of moral commitment and higher levels of organization behavior of their followers. In terms of organization, a leader can only lead a successful organization or group to do that on the one hand their productivity enhance and strengthen its social prestige from the other side. The first factor is much more prominent role in spirituality, because it can lead entering through integrity, humility, respect for others, empathy, good listening and organizational productivity to be raised to an acceptable level in relation to the dignity of spirituality is also a significant social role. You can work with the spiritual leader of indices such as empathy, enhance the organization's reputation.

The relationship between spirituality at work and success in leadership showed in Fig. 4.

3.5. Spirituality, empowerment and entrepreneurship

Entrepreneurship means to explore, evaluate and exploit opportunities, through the creation of new goods and services and as an entrepreneurial organization that is intended to engage in innovative activities acquired a distinct competences and capabilities.

Fig. 4: The relationship between spirituality at work and success in leadership, authors (Khaef Elahi et al., 2010)

According to many researchers they played roles of entrepreneurs in creating competitive advantages are significant. Individual entrepreneurs have characteristics such as risk taking, independence, determination and achievement and empowerment and spirituality of the factors that have an impact on it. Based on organic approach, empowerment is not something that managers should do for employees, but also attitudes and perceptions about their role in job and the organization. At the same time, managers can provide context and opportunities necessary for empowerment of employees. Psychological empowerment is defined by competence, autonomy (choice right), meaning and impact. Merit is the degree to which a person can do the job with skill and success. Meaningful is opportunity in which
people feel important and valuable to pursue career goals; Meaningful is the fit between business requirements and beliefs, values and behaviors. Autonomy is an activity that is associated with a feeling of freedom and the right experience and a psychological need is felt, and finally a degree that one can make an impact on the results of strategic, administrative and affect operational jobs. The results show that the proposed variables in entrepreneurial behavior staff and spirituality influence individual and group and organizational levels necessary part of understanding entrepreneurship; In fact organizational spirituality acts as a mediator in the relationship between psychological empowerment and entrepreneurial behaviors (Hosseinpur et al, 2011)(Fig. 5).

3.6. Spirituality and customer satisfaction

Senobar and RahimiAghdam (2014) stated that as spirituality in the workplace increase the integrity, confidence, organizational commitment, reducing the desire to exit and continue on the staff and in the states that employee behaviors set related to customer perception of service quality and customer satisfaction is effective in this regard voluntary employee behavior has a higher impact that these behaviors are part of organizational citizenship behavior. They went on to express that spirituality in the workplace effect on organizational citizenship behavior and this factor in how to serve the employees to customers affected and their satisfaction will be provided. The important point is that in investigation of these two researchers to conclude that organizational citizenship behavior in this regard has the role of moderator (Fig. 6).

4. Research methodology

Analysis method in above investigation according to the questions posed in this study utilizes from data meta-analysis of previous studies in answer. Meta-analysis by systematic review of sources to finding, evaluating, synthesizing and summarizing, addresses the articles which have already been done on a particular topic. Because the meta-analysis is as applied research, that is as meta-applied research and data collection referred above to books, Internet, documents and literature are available. In these research inclusion criteria discussed studies focus solely on spirituality in the workplace or organization in studies titles. There are no restrictions in sample population in meta-analysis according to previous studies, such as Pearson, whit 5 case studied, so in this study the number of 7 articles was considered to examine effects of spirituality in organization or work environment

5. Results

During the review of seven researches that addressed spirituality in organization from different aspect, the results were as follows. It should be noted that two articles from dimension qualitative methodology and other articles by the quantitative methods utilizes a correlation, regression methods has been addressed this subject. The resulting detail is visible in Table 1.

6. Conclusion

Spirituality is a personal concept that every individual to fit their mindset provides a separate definition from it. The researchers define spirituality in life as meaning and knowledge. The spirituality
goal in the workplace enhances the spiritual and of
inner life of staff.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The results of assumptions and questions related to spirituality</th>
<th>Research variables associated with spirituality</th>
<th>Researchers and year</th>
<th>Type of research</th>
<th>Research title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spirituality is bridge between the dimensions of biological, social, psychological, spiritual, self-reliance to elevate the person is feeling. In fact, spirituality is to be sensitive to the four communications to perfection defined as a person who creates the variable sensitivity of the exogenous variables and mediation with a mediator or lacks variables within the composition of the.</td>
<td>(Interpersonal interactions (psychological), interpersonal (social), intrapersonal communication (bio), to self (spiritual) Mediating variables (meaningful work self-actualization, a sense of belonging) Internal variables (motivation, performance, reliability, efficiency, effectiveness)</td>
<td>Abedi Jafari and Rastegar (2007)</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>emergence of spirituality in organizations, Concepts, definitions, assumptions, conceptual model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Between the spirituality experience and organizational citizenship behaviors in the workplace there is a direct relationship. Between the spirituality experience in the workplace and there is a direct relationship between altruism of organizational citizenship behavior. Between the experience spirituality in the workplace and there is a direct relationship between the conscience of organizational citizenship behavior. Between and passed through the experience of spirituality in the workplace and there is a direct relationship of organizational citizenship behavior. Between the spirituality experience and civic virtue dimension of organizational citizenship behavior in the workplace is directly proportional.</td>
<td>Spirituality organizational citizenship behavior (altruism, conscientiousness, sportsmanship and forgiveness, civil behavior)</td>
<td>Farhangi et al., (2006)</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Spirituality in the workplace and its role in improving organizational citizenship behavior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a significant relationship between spirituality and creativity.</td>
<td>Spirituality Creativity</td>
<td>Moghimi et al., (2006)</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Organizational spirituality and its effect on creativity (Comparative approach)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spirituality satisfaction leader, Loyalty to the organization Ethical commitment, Upgrade the level of behavior in organizations, Productivity, organization’s social reputation. Spirituality will lead to success in leadership.</td>
<td>Spirituality The satisfaction from the leader, Loyalty to the organization Ethical commitment, Upgrade the level of behavior in organizations, Productivity, Social reputation Success in leadership</td>
<td>Khaef Elehi et al., (2010)</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Components of spiritual leadership in organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The results of the study showed a significant correlation assumptions workplace spirituality and customer</td>
<td>Spirituality OCB Customer satisfaction</td>
<td>Senobar and RahimiAghdam (2014)</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Spirituality in the workplace customer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There is a significant relationship between spiritual work and entrepreneurial behavior. There is no significant relationship between psychological empowerment and spirituality working.

| There is a significant relationship between spiritual work and entrepreneurial behavior. There is no significant relationship between psychological empowerment and spirituality working. | Spirituality psychological empowerment | Hosseinpur et al., (2011) | Quantitative | Spirituality as a link between empowerment and entrepreneurial behavior |

In the meantime, during the review article by Abedi Jafari and Rastegar (2007) was formulated as a comprehensive definition of spirituality in organizations that according to available research, spirituality at work is the bridge between the dimensions of biological, social, psychological and spiritual human self-actualization, meaningful and purposeful personal excellence. In response to the first question of research, review articles indicated the presences of six factors of spirituality in organizations that improve organizational citizenship behavior conclude: 1. Organizational behavior improvement 2. Creativity 3. Commitment 4. Success in leadership 5. Entrepreneurship 6. Performance satisfaction for customer. Research on organizational citizenship behavior done by Farhangi et al. (2006) altruism dimensions of organizational citizenship behavior contains conscience, citizenship behavior, sportsmanship that passed through Pearson correlation coefficient at 99% confidence level, the average correlation (0.715) was achieved with regard to the individual aspects of the correlation between altruism (0.619), conscience (0.464), civil behavior (0.346) and magnanimity and forgiveness (0.513). The results showed that all coefficients at the level of 99% are meaningful and continue with structural equation modeling was used to assess the impact of each of the results showed that the spiritual aspects of altruism and generosity in the organization has the greatest impact is on. The spirituality and creativity in research done by Moghimi and colleagues (2006) is effective as creative ability to produce creative ideas in order to produce a product. Continuing through the test of independence, thereby measuring the amount of Pearson chi-square test was 35.177 at a significance level of 0.00 to the conclusion that spirituality and creativity are strongly associated with each other. The spirituality and entrepreneurial behavior research done by Hosseinpur and colleagues (2010) was found that empowerment reflects the psychological status of employees and empowered employee must after the transfer of power, employee should reflect the attitudes and understanding of oneself in his jobs. On the other hand, stated that spirituality is an essential part of understanding in relation to psychological empowerment and entrepreneurial behavior acts as a mediator. Then, through the Spearman correlation test proved that the correlation between psychological empowerment and spirituality staff (0.440) and the spirituality of work and entrepreneurial behavior with correlation coefficients (0.831) there is a significant relationship, then the relationship linear regression analysis among the psychological and spiritual empowerment and spirituality do something with entrepreneurial behaviors were studied, the results showed that the psychological empowerment, entrepreneurial behavior and spirituality have a marked effect on each other. Regarding spirituality and its impact on leadership success in qualitative research performed by Khaef Elahi et al. (2010), was found that spirituality in leadership success contains factors as:

1. High satisfaction level of staff
2. Loyalty to the organization
3. Moral obligation
4. The promotion of behavioral level of staff.

Then, when leader can be successful in a leadership of followers that on the other hand, organizational productivity rises and strengthen their social reputation in the context of spirituality through affecting humility, integrity, empathy, fair and productivity increases raises efficiency and the use of indicators of spirituality such as empathy, enhances the reputation of the organization. About organizational commitment and spirituality, Kordtamini and kuhi study (2011) commitment in continuance, and normative level and the whole levels has significantly related to spirituality and spirituality at all levels affects. In this context, the Pearson correlation results showed that there is significant positive correlation between organizational spirituality and emotional commitment (0.15), continuance commitment (0.247), normative (0.406) and with total dimensions (0.396). In the following using...
regression analysis the impact of spirituality on commitment dimensions was confirmed. The result was that spirituality existence in organization is inevitable because of the increase loyalty and commitment to the organization resulting in increased efficiency. The effects of spirituality on serving customers and thus increase their satisfaction, in correlation analysis proved a significant correlation (0.55) between customer satisfaction and spirituality in organizations exists. In fact, meaningful work, sense of solidarity, alignment with organizational values in their public services to affected customers, is resulted in customer satisfaction. In response to the second question and provide a comprehensive model of the effects of spirituality, according to studies Fig. 7 is presented:

![Comprehensive model of the effects of spirituality on the organization](image)

Fig. 7: comprehensive model of the effects of spirituality on the organization, authors (from the study).

References


